



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, JULY 27TH, 2023
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM

Members Present:

John Taylor, Chair
Richard Vincent, Vice Chair
Cara Mathis
Roxanne Vaitkus
David Herring

Members Absent:

Angelique Fabiani
Karl Ecker

Staff Present:

Alex Cameron, Planning Director
Pamela Graham, Planning Supervisor
Maria Carpenter, Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board
Lori Hercules, IT Technician
Paul Conners, IT Technician

Approximately 6 member(s) of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Taylor called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:00 PM. Mr. Taylor explained the purpose of the meeting, each Commission member introduced themselves, and Mr. Taylor introduced Staff. Mr. Taylor noted the absence of Ms. Fabiani and Mr. Ecker.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 06-22-2023 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Herring moved to approve the minutes of the June 22nd, 2023 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Ms. Vaitkus. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Ms. Mathis moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

III. Public Hearing

All Commission members stated they had visited all sites and did not have any ex parte communication.

Mr. Taylor explained the procedures of a quasi-judicial public hearing.

Ms. Carpenter was sworn into the Public Hearing and testified as follows.

A. COA-2023-00244 (85 Shaw Rd. SW)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for adding a front porch and rear patio, enclosing a patio area, adding a driveway, and other modifications at 85 Shaw Rd. SW. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number

00014388. *The property owners are James and Karen Gleason and the applicant is Frank Cheney.*

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission and Ms. Carpenter discussed the pergola being subject to Accessory Structure setbacks and, therefore, not being required to be within the building envelope for the lot, and the items that would normally require Minor Work approval being included in the Major COA application to make the process easier on the Applicant.

Mr. Frank Cheney, architect, was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Cheney thanked Staff for their help during the application process, gave background on the property's status within the District as a non-contributing property; and stated the intention behind the proposed work is to provide the Owner(s) and Public with a gracious way to access the front door, to enjoy the front porch, and to be able to turn around a vehicle on the property instead of having to back out into Shaw Rd. Mr. Cheney reviewed style details of the proposed work, which were chosen to provide curb appeal to the classic ranch styling of the structure, and emphasized the fact that the property would be landscaped in a style representative of the work done by Mr. Olmsted. Mr. Cheney referenced a book written by Virginia & Lee McAlester on American houses (*A Field Guide to American Houses*) for further details on the style of the proposed work.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, and Mr. Cheney discussed the windows being replaced on the front of the structure, the brick being cut under two windows on the front of the structure with wood panels and larger shutters being installed (Exhibit A-3.1), an ornamental railing being added to the front porch (Mr. Cheney referenced page 553 of the McAlester book, which provides examples of ornamental railings on Neoclassical porches), the existing gutter system running along the front of the structure being replaced with a copper colored gutter system, the ornamental railing on the front porch being metal and painted black, the two existing and functional eyebrow windows not being altered or removed in any way, the proposed new pergola having a fireplace as depicted with minor modifications (Exhibit A-2.12) and the pergola approval being a Minor Work / Staff approval, and a similar ornamental railing to what is proposed for the front porch existing on a property near or at 150 Everette Rd.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Taylor noted a handout Mr. Cheney provided to the Commission was not part of the record nor a part of the formal application.

The Commission deliberated on whether the proposed work meets the Standards in that it is compatible with the architectural character of the existing structure as many of the proposed work details are not details found on a classic ranch style structure, being able to approve the COA when the Commission has not been provided with a drawing detailing the design of the proposed ornamental railing for the front porch, the structure not being any one specific style and having many different design elements as do many structures within the Historic District that were built prior to the existence of the Historic Preservation Commission, offering the Applicant the option to defer the case to the next Public Hearing in order to provide the Applicant with time to make modifications or additions to the application, and the need to not only consider the congruity of the proposed work in relation to this specific property but, also, the District as a whole.

Mr. Herring wanted it to be noted that, if the COA is approved, the ornamental railing for the front porch will be as drawn in the exhibits and be made of black, wrought iron.

Ms. Mathis moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2023-00244) and find the proposed Major Work at 85 Shaw Rd. SW is not consistent with Historic District Standards but is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Vaitkus. Approved by a vote of 4-1 with Mr. Herring voting "Nay".

B. COA-2023-00246 (15 Fields Rd.)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for changes to previously approved COA-2022-00039 at 15 Fields Rd. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00029479. The property owners are Joseph and Amy Iverson and the applicant is James Secky.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence with the exception of Exhibits A-2.1, A-2.5, and A-2.6.

The Commission did not have any questions for Staff.

Mr. James Secky, Designer / Contractor / Owner Representative, was sworn into the public hearing.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, and Mr. Secky discussed the change in windows from two over one to two over two (Exhibit A-2.12, item C/6) being done to make that element of the individual elevation of the structure stand out, the use of battens on the East and North elevations in place of brick being done to follow the horizontal element of those individual elevations to make the viewers eye travel along the horizontal line, and the need for Applicants to seek approval from the Commission prior to making changes to a previously approved COA (Mr. Secky apologized for not communicating the changes made to the previously approved COA earlier).

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work.

Mr. Bruce Duncan, 10 Fields Rd., expressed appreciation for the Commission's work, noted his familiarity with the Historic Preservation Commission process for COA approval from remodeling his property approximately 8 years ago, and stated, despite all of the changes made, the property in question is a gorgeous property and is congruous with the character of the District.

Ms. Mathis clarified that the approval process is in place to prevent worst case scenarios from happening when changes are made without approval.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2023-00246) and find the proposed Major Work at 15 Fields Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Vincent moved to adjourn the Public Hearing and re-enter the Regular Meeting. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Minor Work COA's Issued 06/14/2023 – 07/14/2023.

Ms. Mathis spoke with the Commission about the log cabin once owned by Annie Oakley that is currently located in the Pinewild neighborhood, the intention to tear the cabin down, Ms. Leslie Bryans of the Pines Preservation Guild's assessment that the structure is salvageable and can be relocated, and asked the Commission to get involved in helping to save the historic structure.

Ms. Mathis disclosed a personal connection to the "ask for forgiveness not permission" approach to work being done on a property within the Historic District and stated she had drafted a letter for the Commission to review prior to sending the letter to local realtors to use

as a handout for anyone purchasing a property within the Historic District. Mr. Taylor expressed support for the idea. The Commission discussed various ways to possibly disseminate information to new homeowners or those interested in purchasing a home within the Historic District.

Mr. Taylor reviewed the section of the proposed Standard revisions from the Work Session held prior to the current Regular Meeting that dealt with tree removal, provided background on the proposed revisions, and asked the Commission to consider the proposed revisions during a future Work Session. The Commission discussed scheduling a Work Session for before the September meeting as the case load for the August meeting looked to be rather heavy (8 cases). The Commission further debated aspects of the Standards dealing with tree removal.

V. Next Meeting Date
08-24-2023 Regular Meeting

VI. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Herring moved to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 5-0 at 05:27 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is located on the Village website: www.vopnc.org.

The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community which reflects our rich history and traditions.

Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors.

Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.