



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
JULY 22, 2021
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
David Herring
Terry Lurtz
John Taylor

Members Absent:

Richard Vincent
Anne Lucey

Staff Present:

Alex Cameron, Lead Planner
Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board

Approximately 12 members of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:03 PM and explained the purpose of this meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 06-17-2021 Special Meeting Minutes

Mr. Herring asked for clarification in the last paragraph of page 2. Mr. Cameron and Mr. Herring discussed amendments and what authorities the HPC has as it relates. Mr. Cameron agreed to amend minutes to read “may not have the authority” as opposed to “does not have the authority”.

Mr. Von Salzen asked for a motion on minutes as amended.

Mr. Taylor moved to approve the amended minutes of the June 17th, 2021 Special Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

B. 06-24-2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Schroeder moved to approve the minutes of the June 24th, 2021 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

III. Public Hearing

Mr. Lurtz moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor, Mr. Schroeder, and Mr. Von Salzen stated they had visited all sites with no ex parte communication.

Mr. Herring stated he had not visit any sites.

Mr. Lurtz stated he had visited all sites and did have ex parte communication with the owners of 35 Laurel Rd limited to their describing the work that was proposed to be done on site, which he requested because he had not yet received the staff report at the time of his site visit.

Mr. Von Salzen entered into evidence the revision to the agenda moving 87 Short Rd item C to item H of the agenda.

A. COA 2021-000099 (170 McCaskill Rd W.)

Mr. James Dunagan was sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Alexandria Rye was sworn into the public hearing and testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 170 McCaskill Rd W. The exterior modifications include removing a small dormer to replace with a larger dormer for the addition of an elevator shaft. All exterior material required for elevator addition proposed to match existing. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00015303. The property owner is Madeline Klingenmeyer and the applicant is Dunagan Builders.

Ms. Rye corrected the record to reflect that the property owner is Mr. James Dunagan not Ms. Madeline Klingenmeyer as listed on the Moore County GIS. Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the correction to the address listed on the Staff Report, the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye and the Commission discussed details of the information entered into evidence. Ms. Rye clarified for Mr. Herring why the work proposed is subject to the guidelines of an addition. Ms. Rye clarified property ownership and street direction for Mr. Schroeder.

The Commission asked Mr. Dunagan for clarification on the different types of doors submitted as part of Mr. Dunagan's application. Mr. Dunagan stated the door in question is the door leading to the basement and would be eliminated. Mr. Von

Salzen asked if Staff was willing to proceed with the work as amended or if removal of the door would change Staff recommendation. Ms. Rye stated it would add a few guidelines but the existing guidelines would, also, apply to the removal of the door. Therefore, nothing would change on behalf of the Staff recommendation. Mr. Schroeder verified acceptance would be amended to include the removal of the basement door and materials used in the place of the door would be in kind with what already exists on the property.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 170 McCaskill Rd W congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 170 McCaskill Rd W. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Lurtz questioned combining the two separate motions into one motion. Mr. Cameron discussed this simplification with the Commission and stated this is something the Staff would be willing to work on with the Commission.

B. COA 2021-00100 (15 Beulah Hill Rd)

Ms. Margaret Anne Ellis and Mr. Michael Hess were sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 15 Beulah Hill Road. The exterior modifications include two additions, two retaining walls, and decorative wall leading to front entrance. PID Number 00015557. The property owner is Allen Craig and Margaret Ann Trustee and the applicant is Margaret Ellis.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye, Ms. Ellis, and the Commission discussed the style of the proposed window, directional location of the proposed addition, and the proposed retaining walls.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 15 Beulah Hill Rd is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact, for the following reasons given: *The proposed changes appear to be compatible to the existing windows as well as characteristics of the home and are compatible to others within the Historic District.* Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 15 Beulah Hill Rd. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

C. COA 2021-00107 (35 Laurel Rd) – corrected to COA 2021-00112

Ms. Dorathy Black and Mr. Michael Black were sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 35 Laurel Road. The exterior modifications include Existing garage will be closed in, garage doors to be replaced with windows. Existing sliding glass doors on left elevation (facing Laurel Rd) will be replaced, side entrance door will be replaced. Horizontal siding in gable to be replaced with cedar impression shakes. Existing brick to be painted. Replace existing asphalt shingles and install window boxes under new windows. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00030715. The property owner is Peter Smith and the applicant is Exterior Improvements.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the corrected exhibits for the application, the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye, Ms. Black and the Commission discussed the difference in elevation facing Laurel Rd. to what is depicted in the application material, the removal of all shutters from the property and painting of the brick. Ms. Black stated the proposed work is

intended to beautify the property and make it more consistent with the other properties located on the street.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. Mr. Steve Duncan of 25 Laurel Rd., Pinehurst, NC was sworn into the public hearing. Mr. Duncan stated he and all the neighbors are thrilled with the work Mr. and Ms. Black are proposing and hope the Commission will approve their application.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 35 Laurel Rd is not consistent with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact, for the following reasons given: *The proposal of the new doors and installation of a new window, new roofing shingles, siding material, and painted brick appear to be compatible and are within the guidelines of the Historic District. This would appear to be compatible to the existing windows as well as compatible to others within the Historic District.* Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 35 Laurel Rd. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor stated that, as a former longtime neighbor of Mr. and Ms. Black, the property is a neat house and the proposed work is interesting.

D. COA 2021-00108 (83 Short Rd)

Mr. Martin Dean was sworn into public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 83 Short Road. The exterior modifications include Enclosing existing patio and adding new screened in patio area. Add a fireplace to the proposed screened porch on the rear of the structure. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00017850. The applicant and property owner is Natalie and Scott Hawkins.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the corrected name on the Staff Report and Findings of Fact, the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye and the Commission discussed the area of the patio to be covered by the proposed screened in porch.

Mr. Dean and the Commission discussed the benefits of the proposed work, types of building material to be used, and type and location of the fireplace.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 83 Short Rd congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District and consistent with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 83 Short Rd. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

E. COA 2021-00109 (90 Linden Rd)

Ms. Katharine Pate and Mr. William Huckabee were sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 90 Linden Road. The exterior modifications include a two-story addition to match existing structure, replace all roofing material and change color, and add decking to the front of the addition. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00018482. The property owner is Katharine Pate and the applicant is Katharine Pate.

Ms. Rye corrected the owner is Ms. Pate not the different owner listed on Moore County GIS and that Ms. Pate was able to provide evidence of ownership. Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Pate commented that the proposed work is in keeping with the existing character of the property. The Commission discussed the difference in window size from upper to lower levels and the difference in style of the proposed lower level window to the existing lower level windows.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 90 Linden Rd congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District and consistent with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 90 Linden Rd. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

F. COA 2021-00113 (85 McIntyre Rd)

Ms. Lori Davis was sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 85 McIntyre Road. The exterior modifications include removal of a door to replace with window, replace vinyl siding, and replace driveway material. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00018482. The property owner is Irene Frye and the applicant is Scott Lincicome.

Ms. Rye entered into evidence Exhibit F – Back Elevation photo of the property. Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye, Ms. Davis and the Commission discussed proposed fencing, which is a separate application and not part of the approval sought from the Commission as part of this case.

Ms. Davis stated the proposed work is an attempt to improve the look of the property, install siding properly and bring the property more into character with the surrounding properties. Ms. Davis and the Commission discussed replacing the existing vinyl siding with vinyl siding and modifying the size of shutters proposed to fit the window along with modifying the size of the existing shutters to fit the window.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 85 McIntyre Rd is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact, for the following reasons given: *The proposal of the door relocation and installation of a new window appear to be compatible to the existing windows as well as compatible to others within the Historic District. The proposed use of vinyl siding as exterior material appears to be a synthetic material that is intended to look like painted wood. Many homes within the district consist of vinyl siding similar to that proposed. Given the details of what has been submitted for review, the proposal appears to be compatible with other buildings within the Historic District.* Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 85 McIntyre Rd. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor questioned Staff about unrelated work being done at 95 McIntyre Rd. Mr. Cameron verified 95 McIntyre Rd had come before the Commission in February and was given approval for work to proceed.

G. COA 2021-00116 (25 Laurel Rd)

Mr. Steve Duncan was sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 25 Laurel Road. The exterior modifications include changing the roof color. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00024301. The property owner is Ernest Duncan Sr., Trustee and the applicant is Weatherguard Roofing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Duncan stated the work being done is a result of the hail storm this area experienced in May. Mr. Duncan and the Commission discussed the work and material being used.

Mr. Taylor questioned Staff as to reason for “not consistent” recommendation. Mr. Cameron stated the reason for the “not consistent” recommendation was due to the color change.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at **25 Laurel Rd** is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact, for the following reasons given: *The proposed roof change is in color only. The proposed color is within the Village of Pinehurst Color Palette and is similar to and compatible to others within the Historic District.* Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor moves that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at **25 Laurel Rd**. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

H. COA 2021-00101 (87 Short Rd)

Ms. Judy Davis was sworn into the public hearing.

Senior Planner Ms. Rye testified as follows:

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to the home at 87 Short Road. The exterior modifications include removal of a window, adding guest parking, specify driveway material, exterior changes to accessory structure. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 00017849. The property owner is Judith Davis, Frances Trustee and the applicant is Judith Davis.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and entered into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant’s Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Ms. Rye, Ms. Davis and the Commission discussed the proposed work of securing the rear entry. Ms. Davis stated the photo shown was of an addition and would have the same siding as the existing.

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at **87 Short Rd** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and

consistent with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 87 Short Rd.** Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor moved to close the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Herring asked about the motion template. Mr. Schroeder asked if the motions could be combined into one and preferred the structure of the motion template used for this meeting. Mr. Cameron confirmed a combination of the motions would be done.

Mr. Lurtz asked about the demolition of 90 McCaskill not moving forward. Mr. Cameron stated the approval for demolition is good for 365 days and is eligible for an extension. Mr. Von Salzen stated a demolition permit does not have to be utilized. However, if work is being done to improve the current property then a new application would need to be submitted. Mr. Cameron clarified the approval that was given was for remodel / addition not a demolition.

Mr. Schroeder asked for additional elevations that might pose a question to be included in the Commission member packets. Mr. Cameron and Ms. Rye stated additional elevations can always be displayed during the meeting.

Mr. Herring asked for the Staff presentation to be condensed. Ms. Rye and Mr. Cameron stated Staff would be able to condense the Staff presentation.

Mr. Herring asked if the Staff would be able to focus on directions used on plans and correct directional errors on material submitted by the applicants. Mr. Cameron stated using front, rear, left and right is a more simple way to describe direction.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Staff Approvals July 2021 Meeting

V. Next Meeting Date

A. Regular Meeting on August 26th, 2021 at 4:00 pm

VI. Comments from Attendees

None

VII. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Taylor made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0 at 5:40 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Shannon Konstantinou". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Shannon" and last name "Konstantinou" clearly distinguishable.

Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is available on the Village website at www.vopnc.org.

Vision: The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community, which reflects our rich history and traditions. Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors. Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.