



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
JUNE 24, 2021
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Richard Vincent
Anne Lucey
David Herring
Terry Lurtz

Members Absent:

John Taylor

Staff Present:

Alex Cameron, Principal Planner
Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board

Approximately 3 members of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:00 PM and explained the purpose of this meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 05-27-2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Lurtz moved to approve the minutes of the May 27, 2021 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

III. Public Hearing

Mr. Vincent moved to recess the regular meeting and open the public hearing. Seconded by Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

All Commissioners disclosed they conducted site visits to all properties on the agenda and had no ex parte communication.

Lead Planner Mr. Alex Cameron was sworn into the public hearing.

A. COA 2021-00095 (160 McCaskill Road E)

Property owner Ms. Mary Catherine Sayers was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Cameron stated the purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historical District to replace existing wood windows with vinyl windows to the existing home at 160 McCaskill Road East. The property is identified by Moore County Parcel ID # 00028652 and the PIN number shown on the presentation. The property owner of record is Mary Sayers.

Mr. Cameron provided background on the property and proposed work from the staff report, and, submitted the following to the record: Staff Report, Presentation, Application, Applicant's materials, Photos / Site plans, and, Findings of Fact.

Without objection, Mr. Von Salzen admitted the materials referenced by Mr. Cameron into evidence.

Mr. Von Salzen asked the Commission if there were any questions for Mr. Cameron. Mr. Schroeder questioned Mr. Cameron as to the contents of the Public Hearing Notice. Mr. Cameron confirmed the contents Mr. Schroeder was questioning is indeed the names of the adjacent property owners whom had been notified.

Mr. Von Salzen thanked Ms. Sayers for her submission and asked Ms. Sayers if there was anything further she would like to add. Ms. Sayers stated the record contained all information needed and added one point as to the structure of the windows, which she felt made the new windows more congruous with the Commission's Standards.

Mr. Von Salzen opened the hearing to questions Commission members may have for Ms. Sayers. The Commission and Ms. Sayers discussed the color and aesthetic of the current and replacement windows.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 160 McCaskill Road East. is **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lutz. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 160 McCaskill Road East. Seconded by Mr. Lutz. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

Mr. Von Salzen thanked Ms. Sayers for her presentation. Ms. Sayers in turn thanked the Commission for their work.

Mr. Von Salzen moved discussion forward to the next case.

B. COA 2021-00096 (5 E McCaskill Road)

Applicant Mr. Brandon Goodman and property owner Ms. Betsy Tyner were sworn in.

Mr. Cameron stated the purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historical District to replace the front door, replace the garage door, replace all shutters, move one window facing NC Hwy 5 (Beulah Hill Rd.) approximately one foot away from the edge of the building, add two windows flanking the existing casement windows facing NC Hwy 5 (Beulah Hill Rd.), and, remove one window facing the rear yard at the existing home of 5 McCaskill Road East. The property is identified by Moore County Parcel ID # 00013981 and the PIN number shown on the presentation. The property owners of record are Jeff and Betsy Tyner.

Mr. Cameron provided background on the property and proposed work from the staff report, and, submitted the following to the record: Staff Report, Presentation, Application, Applicant's materials, Photos / Site plans, and, Findings of Fact.

Without objection, Mr. Von Salzen admitted the materials referenced by Mr. Cameron into evidence.

Mr. Von Salzen asked the Commission if there were any questions for Mr. Cameron. There were none.

Mr. Von Salzen asked if there was anything further the applicants would like to add. Mr. Goodman discussed the proposed and existing windows, and, explained the property owners' reasons for the proposed work.

Mr. Von Salzen opened the hearing to questions Commission members may have for Mr. Goodman or Ms. Tyner.

Mr. Herring referenced Window Item #5 of Exhibit A and the section of the Standards stating the shutters should be ½ the window width. Mr. Herring questioned whether the applicant and property owner would be willing to eliminate the shutters completely in order to remain in compliance with the Standards. Both Mr. Goodman and Ms. Tyner responded, "Yes."

Ms. Lucey questioned whether the photos of proposed work submitted as exhibits were computer generated. Mr. Goodman, "Yes."

The Commission discussed whether trees were being removed. Mr. Goodman confirmed NO trees will be removed in order to complete the proposed work.

Mr. Vincent seconded Mr. Herring's statement regarding the shutters and questioned whether shutters were going to be added to the arched window facing Hwy 5. Mr. Goodman responded there was no plan to add shutters to this window.

Mr. Goodman and the Commission discussed the direction of the garage.

Ms. Lucey questioned whether there is and will be a storm door in front of the front door to the property. Mr. Goodman responded, "Yes," to both questions.

Mr. Von Salzen moved the discussion forward to deliberations.

Mr. Cameron stated as mentioned in the conclusion of the Staff Report that if the HPC would consider a motion to approve the COA the staff recommends a motion that the proposed work is not compliant with the Standards based on the snap-in buttons for the window. The Commission discussed.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 5 McCaskill Road East is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact, for the following reasons given: provided that the shutters on Item #5 Exhibit A not be installed but will be eliminated. Mr. Lurtz seconded. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 5 McCaskill Road East. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

Mr. Von Salzen thanked Mr. Goodman and Ms. Tyner.

Mr. Schroeder moved to close the public hearing. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 6-0.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Staff Approvals June 2021 Meeting

Commission discussed a request from Mayor John Strickland to have the Commission come before The Village Council to discuss recommended changes to the Standards, and, asked the Commission to consider three potential dates during the month of July to do so. The Village Council needs to adopt revised Standards that, at the very least, reflect the changes to the statute 160D. Mr. Von Salzen asked Mr. Cameron to provide a date by which Staff would be able to submit an email to the Commission outlining these changes and recommendations to the Standards.

Mr. Cameron introduced the new Senior Planner Ms. Alexandria Rye.

Mr. Cameron stated he and Ms. Liles were on a conference call with the Historical Preservation Society discussing the 160D changes and receiving guidance from the Society. One instance of this guidance is regarding a footnote from the 160D document the UNC School of Government had prepared. The footnote states the revision in the statutes clarifies terminology to assure consistency with other sections of the general statute Chapter 160D, the standards mentioned are binding for decisions on quasi-judicial certificate of appropriateness decisions, the term in quotes “guidelines” could imply that the standards are advisory in nature rather than the necessary adequate finding standards for decision making. This could be setting up the Commission for challenges. Mr. Schroeder asked for clarification on the source of the footnote. The Commission discussed.

Mr. Cameron presented the update to the HOA-COA Application, which was requested by the Commission during their prior meeting. This addition added an Owner Authorization section to the application. The Commission reviewed and discussed. After review, Ms. Lucey asked for a further revision to the application by adding a section asking for the existing color. Mr. Cameron stated Staff would make this change.

Ms. Lucey asked for clarification on execution of the Commission's discussion with The Village Council. The Commission discussed and reached a consensus on how to proceed with preparations for the upcoming discussion with The Village Council. Mr. Schroeder and Mr. Cameron further discussed a revision block or page, and, an outline of the discussion with The Village Council.

V. Next Meeting Date

A. Regular Meeting on July 22nd, 2021 at 4:00 pm

VI. Comments from Attendees

None

VII. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Vincent made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 6-0 at 4:45 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is available on the Village website at www.vopnc.org.

Vision: The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community, which reflects our rich history and traditions. Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors. Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.