



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
FEBRUARY 25, 2021
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Richard Vincent
Anne Lucey
David Herring
Terry Lurtz
John Taylor

Members Absent:

None

Staff Present:

Peter Hughes, Senior Planner
Kelly Brown, Clerk to the Board

Approximately 28 people in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the meeting to order at 4:00 pm and confirmed a quorum was present.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 01-28-2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Schroeder moved to approve the minutes of the 01-28-2021 regular meeting. Seconded by Mr. Taylor . Approved by a vote of 7-0.

III. Public Hearing

Mr. Vincent moved to recess the regular meeting and open the public hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

All Commissioners disclosed they conducted site visits to all properties on the agenda and had no ex parte communication with the following exceptions: Mr. Lurtz did not visit 90 McCaskill Road; Mr. Von Salzen did not visit 10 Azalea Road or 3 Carolina Vista.

Senior Planner Peter Hughes was sworn into the public hearing.

A. COA-2021-00008 (5 Carolina Vista)

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for the addition of 6 foot solid wood fence at 5 Carolina Vista. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 855212950261. The property owner are Gilbert and Christine Pritchard and the applicant is Homewright Construction.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Applicant Scott Haulsee of Homewright Construction was sworn into the public hearing. Mr. Hughes stated the fence could not be approved as a minor work as it was not compliant with the Historic Standards for the following reasons: proposed fence type was board-on-board; proposed side yard height was six feet; and the fence protruded beyond the front façade of the primary structure. Upon question by Ms. Lucey, Mr. Hughes stated the fence would still be compliant if the vegetation and trees were removed after historic and final zoning inspection, as the homeowners would have a certificate of appropriateness to prove the approval of the fence.

Mr. Haulsee stated the homeowners would consider adjusting the fence so it does not protrude beyond the front of the house. He stated the homeowners are asking for the fence to shield the property from increased lights and noise from Highway 5 and proposed projects at the Pinehurst Resort. Mr. Haulsee provided the Commission with photos of the property, which are located in meeting file in Village Hall. Mr. Haulsee stated he did not know if the homeowners would be removing or adding plantings. He estimated the fence protruded 15 to 20 feet beyond the front of the house.

Debbie Lalor of 80 Azalea Road testified in support of the application at 5 Carolina Vista.

The Commission discussed conditioning approval on maintaining the existing vegetation, as it provided screening.

Ms. Lucey moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 5 Carolina Vista is **not consistent** with the Historic District Standards, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and findings of fact, for the following reasons given:

- *The proposed fence is solid wood;*
- *The fence is painted green;*
- *The fence exceeds 4 feet in height;*
- *The fence protrudes beyond the front of the house*
- *However, the vegetation is there to camouflage the fence*

Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Roll Call

Mr. Vincent	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Schroeder	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Taylor	<i>Aye</i>
Ms. Lucey	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Herring	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Lurtz	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Von Salzen	<i>Aye</i>

Ms. Lucey moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 5 Carolina Vista with the following added condition:

- *The existing vegetation be maintained or replaced*

Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

B. COA-2021-00015 (10 Azalea Road)

Representative Jack Wood of the Village Chapel and applicant Pete Bogle of The Bogle Firm Architecture were sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for approval of modifications to a previously approved Major Certificate of Appropriateness at 10 Azalea Road. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 856209053600. The property owner is Village Chapel Inc. and the applicant Pete Bogle.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Mr. Bogle stated the pediment doorway on the west elevation was changed to match the pediments on the other elevations. He stated they removed an interior data closet which allowed them to add a window on the west elevation that matches the east elevation. He stated these changes will face the interior of the lot and will not be seen from the street.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 10 Azalea Road **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with the Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted, and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 10 Azalea Road. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

C. COA-2021-00016 (90 McCaskill Road)

Applicant Wayne Haddock of Pinehurst Homes was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior modifications to a previously approved Major Certificate of Appropriateness at 90 McCaskill Road. He stated the primary structure currently on the lot was approved by the Commission for demolition; the modifications are for the previously approved new single-family home. The modifications include the addition of a window, changing material from shake to lap siding, and addition of two porch columns. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 855208870756. The property owners are Amanda and Michael McCabe and the applicant is Pinehurst Homes.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Mr. Haddock stated the siding would be composite hardie board. Upon question by Ms. Lucey, Mr. Hughes stated tree removal was approved with a prior COA and was not relevant to the current application in front of the Commission. He stated the changes before the Commission were related to the building façade. Upon question by Mr. Herring, Mr. Haddock stated it would be hard to line up the top of the windows and doors, but could consider a seven foot door. Referring Mr. Haddock stated the column addition was to provide aesthetic balance.

The Commission discussed conditioning the height of the door.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 90 McCaskill Road **congruous** the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with the Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted, and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 90 McCaskill Road. Mr. Herring. Seconded by. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

D. COA-2021-00017 (8 Village Lane)

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for multiple exterior modifications at 8 Village Lane. The proposed modifications include an addition and the addition of one window to the left side of the structure. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 855208879807. The property owner is Sharon Day and the applicant is Pinehurst Homes.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Applicant Wayne Haddock of Pinehurst Homes stated all of the proposed modifications are on the left side of the house. He stated they are adding an additional 400 square feet. He stated the screened porch is staying within the existing footprint. Mr. Haddock stated you would only see the proposed brick wall from Caddell Road, which blends in with the existing house. He stated the basement is accessed from inside the house. Mr. Haddock confirmed the proposed roofing material is metal and has standing seams. He confirmed the proposed roof would be compliant with the Standards.

Mr. Hughes stated the existing primary structure has both asphalt single roofing and brown colored metal roofing. Mr. Haddock stated the proposed metal roofing was chosen to match the existing roofing over the bay window, which was copper colored.

Mr. Vincent moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 8 Village Lane **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted, and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 6-1.

Mr. Vincent moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 8 Village Lane. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

E. COA-2021-00018 (83 Short Road)

Applicant Natalie Dean Hawkins was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for a proposed garage addition to an existing primary structure and enclosure of an existing screened-in porch at 83 Short Road. The applicant is also proposing to remove a tree only visible from the canopy and not the trunk. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 856200285541. The property owner is 85 Short Road Pinehurst LLC and the applicant is Natalie Dean Hawkins.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Mr. Hughes stated the height of an accessory structure shall not exceed the height of the primary structure, however the proposed garage is considered an addition and the standard would not apply. He stated the covered breezeway connects the primary structure and proposed garage, therefore it is considered by the Pinehurst Development Ordinance and North Carolina Building Code to be an addition.

Upon question by Mr. Lurtz and Ms. Lucey, Mr. Hughes stated the intent of the Historic Standards would have decks on the ground level, but there are other second level decks in the Historic District. Mr. Haddock stated you cannot see the deck from the street. The Commission discussed the scale of the proposed structure and the line-of-sight from the road. Mr. Vincent referenced the site plan, stating the proposed structure is situated behind the primary structure. Ms. Hawkins stated the right of the lot is heavily vegetated, blocking the view of the adjacent property owner. Mr. Haddock stated the height of the proposed garage exceeds the height of the house by 9 or 10 feet. Mr. Hughes stated the Commission has approved other accessory structures and additions in which the height exceeds the primary structure.

Mr. Hughes testified that property owner Bart Boudreaux of 85 Short Road Pinehurst LLC approved of the application.

Ms. Hawkins stated the proposed shutters are operable. She stated the deck will not be painted. Upon question by Mr. Herring, Mr. Hughes stated the garage structure could not be pushed back without encroaching into the setback or losing the proposed deck and stairs.

The Commission discussed the scale of the proposed garage addition, considering the height, the square footage, lot characteristics, and similar structures in the Historic District.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 83 Short Road is **not consistent** with the Historic District Standards, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and findings of fact, for the following reasons given:

- *A second-story deck*

Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 83 Short Road. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

F. COA-2021-00019 (95 McIntyre Road)

Property owners and applicants Marsha and Robert Southers were sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for multiple exterior modifications at 95 McIntyre Road. The proposed exterior modifications include an addition to the primary structure, demolition of an existing accessory structure, and addition of a cupola to the roof. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 856205088856. The property owner and applicant is Somer Southers.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Ms. Southers stated they will use like for like materials to make it look like it's always been there. Ms. Southers stated they are proposing to use vinyl shake siding that matches the existing vinyl siding. She stated the manufacturer calls the color 'creamy,' but she calls it 'yellow.' Ms. Southers stated the size of the cupola was based off the manufacturer's recommendation and the pitch of the roof. She stated she believed the base of the cupola was 40 inches. Ms. Southers clarified there will not be screening the front elevation and that new addition is just a covered porch with a door.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve the removal of the shed and pergola located at 95 McIntyre Road. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the shed and pergola at 95 McIntyre Road. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 95 McIntyre Road is **not consistent** with the Historic District Standards, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and findings of fact, for the following reasons given:

- *Continued use of vinyl siding which applicant has suggested will match existing*

Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 95 McIntyre Road with the following added condition:

- *The applicant provide front elevations with exact dimensions of the cupola*

Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

G. COA-2021-00012 (3 Carolina Vista)

Mr. Taylor was excused from the meeting at 6:35 pm.

Representatives Danny Dominguez of Cooper Carry Architecture and landscape architect Bob Koontz of Koontz Jones Design were sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Hughes stated the purpose of the public hearing was to consider a request within the Pinehurst Historic District for the addition of a commercial structure (hotel known as Wicket Lodge) at 3 Carolina Vista. The property can be further identified in the Moore County Tax Registry by Moore County PIN Number 856213032663. The property owner is Resorts of Pinehurst Inc. and the applicants are Calvin Burkley of Pinehurst Resorts and Jason King of Cooper Carry.

Mr. Hughes provided background on the property from the staff report. He entered the following evidence into the record: staff report, presentation, application, applicant's materials, photos/site plans, and findings of fact.

Mr. Dominguez provided background on the property. He stated the proposal was inspired by the architecture of the Carolina Hotel, the Resort Clubhouse, and the Holly Inn, which includes roof structure, dormers, and octagonal forms. He stated the building is oriented facing north, with rooms facing south.

Mr. Koontz stated they are proposing to remove 33 trees along the parking lot, which are mainly ornamental, to allow for more parking. He stated it is a mix of pine, laurel oak, and some dogwood trees. They will be replacing the trees with pine, holly, and laurel oaks.

Mr. Dominguez stated the height of the building would be 50 feet. He stated the proposed hotel would include 34 guestrooms, lobby, board room, meeting room, rooftop bar, locker rooms, and dining area. He stated the croquet lawns would remain across from the cart path. He stated the board room would have metal roofing. Mr. Dominguez stated the total square footage is 65,800 sf. He stated it was visually important to vary the roofline, as it helps the scale and does not make it look like three stories. He stated they wanted to use the same columns, height, and dormers from the Clubhouse. Mr. Dominguez discussed Exhibit W, the material board. He stated they are looking at a seven inch exposure for the lap siding, but it may be adjusted for the overall scale. He stated they are looking at three different brick types. He stated Exhibit W represents their color palate.

Mr. Herring questioned the service entrance on the west elevation being visible and close to Highway 5. Mr. Koontz stated there would be a wall to screen that area, but do not have the height yet. Mr. Dominguez stated the service area, including garbage can storage and mechanical equipment, is located there as it is the furthest from the guests. Mr. Koontz stated the area will have fitting architecture and will be heavily landscaped. Mr. Hughes stated that the PDO requires the mechanical areas be screened.

Mr. Von Salzen referenced Exhibit W, the material board, and asked if these were specific materials or if it was a "menu board." Mr. Dominguez stated they would choose materials as the project progresses. The Commission discussed needing a more finalized product with more detail, including dimensions. The Commission discussed continuing the hearing so the applicants could

provide more detailed plans. Mr. Koontz stated some level of assurance or approval was needed from the Commission in order to provide finalized elevations for a pending public hearing on a conditional rezoning by the Pinehurst Resort. The Commission and applicants acknowledged that they may have to come back before the Commission if there were changes. Mr. Hughes stated the Commission had previously approved multiple proposed materials for other cases.

Mr. Vincent stated the applicants have provided evidence and examples to show their proposal as congruous with the Historic District. The Commission recognized the plans did not contain all the details of a construction drawing, and again discussed that the applicants may have to come back before the Commission for changes.

Debbie Lalor of 80 Azalea Road testified against the application at 3 Carolina Vista.

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission find the proposed Major Work at 3 Carolina Vista **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted, and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 5-1.

Roll Call

Mr. Vincent	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Schroeder	<i>Aye</i>
Ms. Lucey	<i>No (based on scale)</i>
Mr. Herring	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Lurtz	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Von Salzen	<i>Aye</i>

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed Major Work at 3 Carolina Vista. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-1.

Roll Call

Mr. Vincent	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Schroeder	<i>Aye</i>
Ms. Lucey	<i>No (based on scale)</i>
Mr. Herring	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Lurtz	<i>Aye</i>
Mr. Von Salzen	<i>Aye</i>

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Minor Works Approved by Staff from 1-10-2021 to 2-18-2021

The Commission had no comments.

V. Next Meeting Date

A. Regular Meeting on March 25, 2021 at 4:00 pm

VI. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Lurtz made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0 at 8:06 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,



Kelly Brown
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is available on the Village website at www.vopnc.org.

Vision: The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community, which reflects our rich history and traditions. Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors. Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.