



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, JANUARY 26TH, 2023
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

John Taylor, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Cara Mathis
David Herring
Richard Vincent

Members Absent:

Terry Lurtz

Staff Present:

Maria Carpenter, Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board
Josh Dockery, IT Technician

Approximately 11 member(s) of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Taylor called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:00 PM, explained the purpose of the meeting, each Commission member introduced themselves, and Mr. Taylor introduced Staff. Mr. Taylor noted the absence of Mr. Lurtz.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 12-15-2022 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Schroeder moved to approve the minutes of the December 15th, 2022 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Ms. Mathis moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

III. Public Hearing

All Commission members stated they had visited all sites and did not have any ex parte communication with the exception of Mr. Vincent who did have ex parte communication with the Applicant of Case E: COA-2022-00247 (24 Rattlesnake Trl.) and stated he will be recusing himself from consideration of this case.

Mr. Taylor explained the procedures of a quasi-judicial public hearing.

Mr. Schroeder and Mr. Taylor reminded those in attendance that 4 affirmative votes are needed for approval.

Ms. Carpenter was sworn into the Public Hearing and testified as follows.

A. COA-2022-00223 (20 Orange Rd)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to the principal dwelling to include an addition on the back and the construction of a detached garage in the rear yard at 20 Orange Rd. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00017848. The property owner and applicant is Timothy Drabik.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission had no questions for Ms. Carpenter.

Ms. Cynthia Drabik and Mr. Timothy Drabik were sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Drabik thanked the Commission and stated the intention behind the proposed work is to maintain the property in as close to the existing state as possible.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, and Mr. Drabik discussed the color of the proposed replacement windows being a match to what is existing and the replacement color being a match to a color selected from the approved color palette, the color of the proposed replacement siding being the closest match to a color selected from the approved color palette (siding manufacturer does not offer siding in the approved color palette brand), the proposed replacement windows being a match to the existing in size and style, the elevation depicted in Exhibit S-1.5 showing metal roofing replacing shingle roofing on the overhang and the intention being to have all overhang roofing materials be metal and all main roofing areas be shingle (which will make the property more congruous with surrounding properties), proposed shutters being new but in the same material and color as the existing shutters (which are not repairable), the garage roof matching the main dwelling roof with a mix of shingle and metal materials to keep the look of the two structures consistent, the proposed new siding not being painted and the color Navajo beige being the closed manufacturer color to the color selected from the approved color palette, the Applicants choosing colors for all proposed work that match colors selected from the approved color palette, the front door changing from the existing red color to a brown color selected from the approved color palette, the chimney brick / stone not being painted but left the original color of the brick / stone, both the front and garage doors being brown fiberglass, and the orientation of the proposed driveway necessitating removal of two very large pine trees that will not impact the existing canopy.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Vincent moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00223) and find the proposed Major Work at 20 Orange Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

B. COA-2022-00228 (190 McCaskill Rd W)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for painting the brick exterior and re-roofing at 190 McCaskill Rd W. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00027864. The property owner is Sonja Rothstein and applicant is Baker Roofing Company.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission had no questions for Ms. Carpenter.

Ms. Sonja Rothstein was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rothstein stated the look of the property is more contemporary than surrounding properties and the intention behind the proposed work is to improve the look of the property and make it more harmonious with surround properties.

The Commission had no questions for Ms. Rothstein.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Vincent and Mr. Taylor pointed out Ms. Rothstein's name was misspelled in the application and noted the error for the record.

The Commission discussed the proposed work not being consistent with the Standards, which state painting a brick surface is not appropriate. It was determined painting the brick would be congruous with the Historic District as several surrounding properties have painted brick.

The Commission clarified with Ms. Rothstein the trim, existing windows, and garage door will not be painted. Ms. Rothstein provided background on the development of the neighborhood.

Ms. Mathis moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00228) and find the proposed Major Work at 190 McCaskill Rd. W is not consistent with Historic District Standards but is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Reason for “not consistent” finding: the Standards state painting a brick surface is not appropriate. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

C. COA-2022-00240 (40 McCaskill Rd W)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for replacing windows, adding doors and renovations at 40 McCaskill Rd W. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00026264. The property owners are Robert and Mary Anne Heino, and the applicant is R.G.S. Builders, Inc.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant’s materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission had no questions for Ms. Carpenter.

Mr. Jeremy Strickland was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Strickland stated the intention behind the proposed work is to be able to remove a lot of rot and decay of the wood located in the lower portion of the wall.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, and Mr. Strickland discussed the replacement windows matching the existing windows (Renew by Pella, which is a historic window series, will be used).

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00240) and find the proposed Major Work at 40 McCaskill Rd. W is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony

given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

D. COA-2022-00246 (44 McKenzie Rd E)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a modification to previously approved COA-2021-00122, the elimination of a window, at 44 McKenzie Rd E. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00024541. The property owners are Philip and Emily McCarty, and the applicant is Mitchell Harris, Harris & Son Construction.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission clarified with Ms. Carpenter that the proposed work has already been performed and was not part of the originally approved COA.

Mr. Mitchell Harris was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Harris apologized to the Commission for the proposed work already having been completed and stated the change was done due to the Homeowners' desire to have a fireplace.

The Commission clarified with Mr. Harris the existence of a fireplace (low heating unit with a direct vent) where the originally proposed windows were located.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00246) and find the proposed Major Work at 44 McKenzie Rd. E is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor clarified with Mr. Herring the fact that had the original application have contained the wall as it currently exists with no windows Mr. Herring would have deemed the proposed work congruous.

Mr. Vincent recused himself from consideration of Case E: COA-2022-00247 (24 Rattlesnake Trl.).

E. COA-2022-00247 (24 Rattlesnake Trl)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a modification to previously approved COA-2021-00159 at 24 Rattlesnake Trail. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00021712. The property owner is Atlas Inspections, Inc. and the applicant is Rhetson Companies, Inc.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission and Ms. Carpenter discussed Exhibit S-1.6 (Notification Map) showing one property in solid black, the structures depicted in the notice no longer existing, and the Owner(s) of the property showing in solid black still having received notice of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Matthew Taggart was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Taggart thanked the Commission and stated the original plans were for a plain wall on the south facing side but during preliminary meetings it was suggested to add a window to this wall to help break up the monotony, add balance, and soften this side of the structure. It is Mr. Taggart's opinion the window makes the structure more congruous as well as adding symmetry and balance to the structure. Failing to seek approval prior to installing the window was an oversight and apologized for how the change was handled.

The Commission had no further questions for the applicant.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. Mr. Mike Ratkowski was sworn into the hearing and stated appreciation for the Commission's work and gave background on his experience with historic properties.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00247) and find the proposed Major Work at 24 Rattlesnake Trl is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 4-0.

Mr. Herring moved to adjourn the Public Hearing and re-enter the Regular Meeting.
Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

**IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items
A. Minor Work COA's Issued 12/8/2022 - 1/17/2023**

**V. Next Meeting Date
02-23-2023 Regular Meeting**

Mr. Taylor noted tonight's meeting would have been the final Historic Preservation Commission meeting for Mr. Lurtz who was absent on vacation in Cabo and was the final Historic Preservation Commission meeting for Mr. Schroeder who had served on the Commission for six years.

The Commission and Staff discussed having a Work Session meeting in March 2023 to consider further revisions to the Historic District Standards and what the revisions process should look like. It was determined a date for the Work Session meeting would be set during the next Regular Meeting of February 23rd, 2023.

VI. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Schroeder moved to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 5-0 at 05:11 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is located on the Village website: www.vopnc.org.

The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community which reflects our rich history and traditions.

Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors.

Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.