



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
NOVEMBER 18TH, 2021
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Terry Lurtz
Anne Lucey
Richard Vincent
John Taylor
David Herring

Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Alex Cameron, Lead Planner
Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board

Approximately 9 members of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the Regular Meeting to order at 03:59 PM and explained the purpose of this meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 10-21-2021 Special Meeting Minutes

Ms. Lucey moved to approve the minutes of the October 21st, 2021 Special Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

B. 10-28-2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

The Commission and Staff discussed proposed revisions of the meeting minutes presented by Mr. Herring and the extent to which details of meetings should be recorded in the minutes in relation to the difference between quasi-judicial and other types of meetings.

Mr. Taylor moved to approve the minutes as amended by Mr. Herring and Ms. Lucey of the October 28th, 2021 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 6-1 with Mr. Lurtz voting "Nay".

C. 11-04-2021 Special Meeting Minutes

Mr. Taylor moved to approve the minutes of the November 04th, 2021 Special Meeting. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

III. Public Hearing

Mr. Lurtz moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

All Commission members stated they had visited all sites.

Mr. Taylor did have a brief ex parte communication with the owner of 30 Caddell Road regarding one of the diagrams submitted as evidence.

Mr. Vincent did have ex parte communication with the owner of 5 McLeod Road via text regarding date and time of the meeting.

All other Commission members did not have ex parte communication.

Mr. Von Salzen explained the procedures of a quasi-judicial public hearing.

Ms. Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner, and Mr. Alex Cameron, Planning Supervisor, were sworn into the public hearing and testified as follows.

A. COA-2021-00154 (10 Board Branch Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to the front exterior converting to an A-frame roofline at 10 Board Branch Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856205091171. The property owner and applicant is Kimberly Meade.

Mr. Roy Branch was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission and Staff discussed whether Exhibits X and Y are part of the record. Staff stated the record does include Exhibits X and Y.

The Commission and Mr. Branch discussed the proposed work and the fact that Exhibit C directly represents the work proposed and supersedes all prior exhibits of proposed work. The Commission and Mr. Branch discussed the fascia being slightly

deeper than the current fascia, the slope remaining the same on both sides of the roof, and the posts remaining the same size and being wrapped in white vinyl.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Taylor and Staff discussed the use of vinyl on the posts. Mr. Taylor stated he did not have an objection to the use of vinyl on the posts.

*Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00154) and find the proposed Major Work at **10 Board Branch Road** is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 7-0.*

B. COA-2021-00182 (5 McLeod Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to change the exterior paint color, new roofing, and new windows at 5 McLeod Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856206289691. The property owner and applicant is Jarrod Gouty.

Mr. Jarod Gouty was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission and Staff discussed the congruity of the proposed work.

The Commission and Mr. Gouty discussed the state of the property at the time Mr. Gouty purchased the property, the "Stop Work" order and compliance with that order, the approval of proposed and already completed work, the entry door not having sidelight windows, the style and type of windows as shown in submitted exhibits, the style and type of shutters to be installed (which was not originally listed on the application) shown in submitted exhibits, the side door being a solid utility door, the removal of the tree near the back left corner of the home due to potential foundation damage, the proposed painting of the brick, the CAD drawing being the correct representation of the location of the side door and windows, the size and style of entry door to be used, the need for the applicant to pick a color of blue for the brick and a shutter color from the approved color palette to be used, the structure of the right

elevation will not be changed, the rear deck being re-built as is due to rotted boards with no change to size or style, the gable on the front being congruous with other craftsman properties in the area, the alteration of the roofline over the front door, the brick being painted solid (no brick showing through), and the window area to the left side of the door being fitted with the same size window and the siding surrounding the window being replaced with matching materials to what will be used on other parts of the property.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

The Commission discussed the congruity of painting the brick and having consistency of appearance across the front of the property by having any and all brick painted the same color, which will be chosen from the approved color palette.

The Commission and Mr. Gouty discussed the color and type of wood to be used for the trim and shutters.

The Commission and Mr. Gouty discussed the chimney remaining intact and being painted the same color as the rest of the brick on the property.

The Commission and Staff discussed the consistency and congruity of the proposed work.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00182) and find the proposed Major Work at 5 McLeod Road is not consistent with Historic District Standards but is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Conditions applied are: The proposed color for painting the existing and proposed new brick is to be a blue selected from the approved color palette, "awning" roof will be asphalt shingle to match main roof, and shutters will be stained cedar and will be sized to cover the window in the closed position. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

C. COA-2021-00183 (90 Linden Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to add window on the pool house and a serving shelf on the exterior below the window. Applicant also proposes an interior vault of the ceiling at 90 Linden Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855211667066. The property owner and applicant is Katharine Pate.

Ms. Katherine Pate and Mr. Huckabee were sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission and Staff discussed the proposed work being done and that the window under consideration being depicted in presented material (the window having been installed prior to approval being given).

The Commission, Mr. Huckabee, and Ms. Pate discussed the details of the intentions behind the proposed work, the error of installing the window without prior approval, and the finish of the window being done to match existing windows on the property.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

*Ms. Lucey moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00183) and find the proposed Major Work at **90 Linden Road** is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.*

D. COA-2021-00186 (30 Caddell Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to install a 16'x32' vinyl liner pool in rear yard. Up to 6' deep, standard gray coping, and 8' fiberglass step with railing. Light broom finished concrete decking: 8' at shallow end, 6' around other three sides, and 4x10 walkway from existing patio to pool area at 30 Caddell Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855212972275. The property owner and applicant is Amy Nicholas.

Ms. Nicholas was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission, Ms. Nicholas, and Staff discussed the driveway being located on the left side of the property not the right side of the property as stated, the existing rear fencing being replaced with the same dog eared style fencing, the location and width size of the gates on each side of the dwelling remaining the same, the location

of the fencing being considered part of the rear yard due to the fencing ending at the rear corner of the dwelling, and the fencing requirements necessary to meet building codes as applicable to the installation of a pool on the property.

Ms. Nicholas requested the application be amended to be a 4' standard picket fence at the front facing portions of the fence along each side of the dwelling so long as the picket fence meets both the historical district standards and building code requirements for fencing enclosing a pool.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00186) and find the proposed Major Work at 30 Caddell Road is not consistent with Historic District Standards but is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Conditions applied: 4ft standard picket fence on the front facing side to meet the HPC Standards and building code due to the installation of an in-ground swimming pool, proposed rear yard fence, which is front facing on the left side, is proposed and approved to encroach approximately 6 inches into the side yard fence area. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

E. COA-2021-00188 (87 Short Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to change siding material for garage and house gables from lap siding to stained shingles. Remove garage shingle siding and replace with James Hardie lap siding. Increase laundry room double window size on rear elevation and match other windows on this elevation. Replace existing garage entry door with former kitchen door (wood) at 87 Short, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856205284641. The property owner and applicant is Judith Davis.

Ms. Judith Davis was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission, Ms. Davis, and Staff discussed the previous approved work being depicted in submitted materials and current approvals being limited to the gable

siding materials, laundry room windows, and the garage door as outlined in the current application.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00188) and find the proposed Major Work at 87 Short Road is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

F. COA-2021-00189 (275 Everett Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to Re-roof (Owens Corning Onyx Black Arch), change exterior. Paint color to Sherwin Williams gauntlet gray, change exterior trim to white, and window replacement at 275 Everett Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856205284246. The property owner and applicant is Bortins Construction Contracting, LLC.

Mr. John Bortins was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission, Mr. Bortins, and Staff discussed only the photos presented digitally being approved exhibits, the material and style of windows proposed along with existing trim remaining and all trim being painted white, the material and color of shingle proposed, the intended color scheme for the dwelling, the need for the applicant to choose paint colors from the approved color palette, the replacement of columns on the front and back porches of the dwelling with standard 6x6 square columns, and the amendment of the application to include removal of the hand railings from the front and back porches.

Exhibit X was submitted into evidence by Mr. Bortins, which depicted the style of vinyl window to be used.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. Ms. Judith Davis stated her support of the proposed work.

The Commission and Staff discussed the consistency of the replacement of a round column with a square column. It was determined the shape is consistent with the architectural character of the dwelling.

The Commission and Mr. Bortins discussed the shutters would either remain as is with the exception of being painted white to match other trim or be removed entirely.

The Commission and Mr. Bortins discussed the scale of the proposed 6x6 column versus the existing column in relation to the porch size and soffit.

The Commission, Mr. Bortins, and Staff discussed the chimney brick being painted to match the rest of the brick on the dwelling. In addition, whether the material of the foundation was brick or cement block was questioned.

Mr. Hunter Worley was sworn into the public hearing. Mr. Worley clarified the foundation is cement block and is currently the natural gray color of cement and would be painted the same color as the brick on the rest of the dwelling.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2021-00189) and find the proposed Major Work at 275 Everett Road is not consistent with Historic District Standards but is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Conditions applied: Replacement of porch columns with square wooden stained columns on both porches, colors must be selected from the approved color palette in the HPC Standards, option to paint or remove shutters, and vinyl windows proposed to replace wooden windows but keep wooden trim. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Taylor moved to close the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Minor Work COA's Issued 10/21/21-11/09/21

The Commission and Staff discussed picket fence minor work submittal listed as a minor work approval and the upcoming double drive minor work submittal.

V. Next Meeting Date

A. Regular Meeting December 16th, 2021 at 4:00 pm

The Commission and Staff discussed the need for a Work Session prior to the next meeting. It was decided to have a Work Session from 02:00 to 04:00 PM on December 16th, 2021.

VI. Comments from Attendees

None

VII. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Schroeder made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Taylor.

Approved by a vote of 7-0 at 6:16 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is available on the Village website at www.vopnc.org.

Vision: The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community, which reflects our rich history and traditions. Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors. Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.