



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
OCTOBER 28, 2021
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Anne Lucey
David Herring
Terry Lurtz

Members Absent:

John Taylor
Richard Vincent

Staff Present:

Alex Cameron, Lead Planner
Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board

Approximately 15 members of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:00 PM and explained the purpose of this meeting for the Historic Preservation Commission.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 09-23-2021 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Herring moved to approve the minutes of the September 23rd, 2021 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Herring moved to enter the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

III. Public Hearing

Mr. Von Salzen asked the Commission if any members visited the sites. All Commission members stated they had visited all sites with no ex parte communication.

Mr. Von Salzen explained the procedures of the Public Hearing portion of the meeting.

Mr. Von Salzen introduced an amendment to the published agenda moving Item I (COA-2021-00159 [24 Rattlesnake Road]) to Item A per the Applicant's request due to travel obligations. None objected.

A. COA-2021-00159 (24 Rattlesnake Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the alteration of the exterior façade and interior floor plan to accommodate for new commercial office use at 24 Rattlesnake Trail, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856200082498. The property owner is Atlas Inspections, LLC. and the applicant is Rhetson Companies, LLC.

Ms. Alexandria Rye, Senior Planner, and Mr. Alex Cameron, Planning Supervisor, were sworn into the public hearing and testified as follows.

Mr. Tony Bornhorst, Rhetson Company, was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Bornhorst, the Commission, and Staff discussed the consistency of the proposed work and materials, the window style, the number of stories, the type of siding to be used, the pitch of the roof, and the removal of the canopy and fuel pumps. Mr. Bornhorst stated the work would be immaculate and in keeping with the aesthetics of the Village of Pinehurst.

The Commission and Staff discussed whether the demolition of existing structures was to be considered as part of the Public Hearing for the current COA or whether the demolition would be heard as part of an additional COA. It was determined the demolition was to be considered as part of the current COA.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **24 Rattlesnake Trail** is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

The Commission questioned whether demolition of the existing structure should be included in one motion with the proposed work or in a separate motion to the proposed work. After discussion with Staff, the decision was made to have a separate motion for the demolition.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Demolition at: **24 Rattlesnake Trail** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District

Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

B. COA-2021-00139 (315 Nottingham Gate)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a new single family dwelling at 315 Nottingham Gate, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855200362064. The property owner and applicant is Edmund Haughey and Brooke Haughey.

Mr. Bass was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Bass, the Commission, and Staff discussed samples of colors and materials to be used for the proposed work, the materials listed on the application and plans, and whether additional evidence should be submitted to support the proposed work.

The Commission and Staff debated whether Staff had the authority to subject applications to a list of standards deeming the application to be complete before presenting the application to the Commission for consideration.

Mr. Bass, the Commission and Staff discussed the type materials and finishes to be used including brick type and color, whitewash finish, shingle type and color, and reviewed the proposed material and color lists of the application. Examples of whitewashed brick were displayed and the technique of whitewashing brick was discussed.

Ms. Brooke Haughey was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Haughey electronically submitted additional evidence regarding the proposed use of a whitewash finish on the brick of the proposed dwelling to Ms. Rye. Ms. Rye displayed the evidence submitted by Ms. Haughey.

Mr. Bass, the Commission and Staff discussed the confusion created by multiple versions of the same evidence being submitted and presented. Mr. Bass clarified version S1.2 of the Landscape Plans and S 1.7 date 09-18-2021 of the Elevation Plans were the correct plans to consider.

Mr. Bass, Ms. Haughey, the Commission and Staff discussed the scale of the proposed work in relation to the scale of nearby dwellings and the version of plans to be used when making a decision.

The Commission debated whether there was a sufficient amount of evidence submitted to make a decision. Ms. Lucey stated she did not feel a sufficient amount of evidence had been submitted as to the scale of the proposed work in relation to nearby properties to make a decision. All other Commission members stated they felt a sufficient amount of evidence had been submitted to make a decision.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **315 Nottingham Gate** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Guidelines, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 4-1. Ms. Lucey voted against.

Mr. Von Salzen asked that a process be implemented which allows obsolete documents to be withdrawn from an application.

C. COA-2021-00142 (165 Linden Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for exterior front renovations which include; new door, extended front porch, new windows, convert garage into living space. There is also a proposed shed to be placed in the rear yard at 165 Linden Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855211661263. The property owner and applicant is David Dahlem.

Ms. Christine DiMarco and Ms. Lori Dahlem were sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

The Commission and Staff discussed the dimensions of the pine tree proposed to be removed, the consistency of the proposed work in relation to the removal of the pine tree and existing canopy in the area, the proposed shed, setbacks, removal of existing architectural / structural elements, and the materials and colors to be used in the proposed work.

Ms. DiMarco, Ms. Dahlem, the Commission and Staff discussed the submission of evidence Ms. DiMarco and Ms. Dahlem made during the Public Hearing in support of the proposed work for the shed and the alterations to the primary dwelling and driveway, the colors of materials to be used, the type of lattice work to be used, and the removal of the column from under the front roof overhang. Mr. Herring cautioned

removing the column due to potential structural problems in relation to the support of the porch roof.

Mr. Von Salzen questioned whether there is a concern on the part of any of the Commission members that enough material had been submitted in order to make a decision on the proposed work in relation to the shed. Ms. DiMarco, Ms. Dahlem, the Commission and Staff debated consideration of the proposed work for the shed as part of the current COA. It was decided to allow the Commission to debate approval of the proposed work with the shed included in the current COA.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

The Commission and Staff discussed the consistency of the proposed work and having Staff outline all of the amendments made to the application and evidence during the Public Hearing. The changes to the application and evidence were color renderings of the proposed work to the main structure, which do not demonstrate the proposed changes to the roofline over the current garage area, and the proposed shed, and the movement of the driveway closer to Linden Road without eliminating the Western portion.

Ms. Lucey moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **165 Linden Road** is **not consistent** with the Historic District Guidelines, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Von Salzen stated that any reference to Guidelines during the Public Hearing means Standards.

D. COA-2021-00144 (40 McCaskill Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for Landscape and driveway changes, window changes, addition of glass panels to front door, and removal of cherry tree at 40 McCaskill Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855211762941. The property owner and applicant is Robert and Mary Anne Heino.

Mr. Robert Heino and Mr. Jeremy Strickland were sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Heino, Mr. Strickland, the Commission and Staff discussed the intention behind the proposed work, the size and function of the shutters proposed, the size and location of retaining walls proposed, and Ms. Rye presented an email submitted by Southern Landscape Group in support of the removal of the cherry tree, which is no longer viable. Mr. Von Salzen read excerpts of the email.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **40 McCaskill Road** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Von Salzen moved to recess the public hearing for a 5 minute break at 05:40 PM.

Mr. Von Salzen moved to reconvene the public hearing at 5:45 PM.

E. COA-2021-00150 (100 Saville Row)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a new single family dwelling at 100 Saville Row, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855200359808. The property owner and applicant is Donald and Pamela Munn.

Mr. Matthew Kirby, Kirby Construction, and Mr. Donald Munn were sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Kirby, Mr. Munn, the Commission, and Staff discussed the removal of trees within the footprint of the proposed dwelling along with a 15' area around the proposed dwelling, the style of windows proposed as shown in submitted exhibits, style and type of shutters proposed as shown in submitted exhibits, and the colors of the materials to be used as shown in submitted exhibits.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **100 Saville Row** **congruous**

with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

F. COA-2021-00154 (10 Board Branch Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for renovations to the front exterior converting to an A-frame roofline at 10 Board Branch Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856205091171. The property owner and applicant is Kimberly Meade.

Mr. Roy Branch was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Branch, the Commission, and Staff discussed the consistency of the proposed work in relation to surrounding dwellings, the framing, size and style of the proposed roof work, and the size and style of proposed column work. Mr. Branch stated he wished the Commission to consider the proposed A-frame style of roof as shown in Exhibit B titled "1st Choice" only without the arched entry.

Mr. Branch and the Commission debated whether enough material had been submitted in order to make a decision regarding approval or denial. It was decided to recess the case to a later time during the current Public Hearing in order to give Mr. Branch additional time to present additional material in support of his application.

Mr. Lurtz moved to recess case COA-2021-00154 to a later time during the current Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Schroeder. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

G. COA-2021-00155 (60 Caddell Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the replacement of siding, windows, door, and change paint color of garage at 60 Caddell Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855208972549. The property owner and applicant is Todd Ahrens.

Mr. Wayne Haddock, Pinehurst Homes, was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Haddock, the Commission, and Staff discussed the inconsistency of the proposed work, the lack of a roof replacement being proposed, and the type of materials to be used for the proposed work.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **60 Caddell Road** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

H. COA-2021-00156 (75 Cherokee Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the relocation of the entry to be moved to alley side and add 3-0 door to front side at 75 Cherokee Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855212955985. The property owner and applicant is Thomas and Theresa Berry.

Mr. Haddock remained seated as the representative for COA-2021-00157.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Haddock, the Commission, and Staff discussed the intention of the proposed work.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **75 Cherokee Road** is **inconsistent** with the Historic District Standards, nevertheless is deemed **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Mr. Von Salzen amended Mr. Herring's motion to read **not consistent**. Seconded by Ms. Lucey. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

I. COA-2021-00157 (305 Nottingham Gate)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a new single family dwelling at 305 Nottingham Gate, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 855200364006. The property owner is LINDEN CLOS, LLC. and the applicant is Susan Fletcher.

Mr. Will Huntley, Huntley Design Build, was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Huntley, the Commission, and Staff discussed the inconsistency of the roof pitches, the Southern Cottage style of the proposed work, the architectural characteristics of the front elevation, the style and size of shutters proposed, the landscaping surrounding the property, and the style of retractable screens

Ms. Rye corrected the record to reflect Ms. Susan Fletcher is the owner of the property, not Linden Clos, LLC, and stated Ms. Fletcher had submitted documentation verifying ownership of the property.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **305 Nottinghill Gate** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Von Salzen asked for a motion to end the recess of case COA-2021-00154 (10 Board Branch Road).

Mr. Schroeder moved to end the recess of case COA-2021-00154. Seconded... Approved 5-0.

COA-2021-00154 (10 Board Branch Road) Reconvened

Mr. Branch submitted into evidence amended sketches of the proposed work as Exhibits X and Y. The Commission and Staff reviewed Exhibits X and Y in relation to the proposed work.

Mr. Von Salzen questioned Mr. Branch as to the length of his experience as a builder / contractor and whether, in his experience, the A-frame roof line being proposed can be done. Mr. Branch stated he has 35 years of experience and is confident the A-frame roof line can be successfully installed. Mr. Branch and the Commission discussed the porch roof would be rebuilt, the porch roof eve elevation would be raised to the main roof elevation, the porch roof would be hipped along the front face, and the A-frame was to be as wide as the existing center two columns.

Mr. Branch and the Commission debated whether, even with Exhibits X and Y, enough material had been submitted to support a decision being made.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **10 Board Branch Road** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Ms. Lucey.

Mr. Branch and the Commission discussed the motion and the substantiality of the material submitted.

Mr. Von Salzen ruled to continue the case to 11-18-2021 at 04:00 PM.

J. COA-2021-00160 (5 Everett Road)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the removal of trees at 5 Everett Road, Pinehurst, NC. The property is identified by Moore County PID Number 856209064852. The property owner and applicant is Brandon Sowell.

Mr. Brandon Sowell was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Rye discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report, the Staff Presentation, Application, Applicant's Material, Photos / Site Plans, and Findings of Fact. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the material submitted by Ms. Rye into evidence.

Mr. Lurtz requested Applicants be asked to band trees when an application is submitted for tree removal.

Mr. Sowell, Staff and the Commission discussed the health of the trees, and whether the opinion of an arborist can be submitted.

Ms. Lucey requested Applicants be asked to have a professional evaluation done by an arborist or landscaping expert to be submitted into evidence in support of their application. Mr. Sowell, Staff and the Commission discussed Ms. Lucey's request.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether any member of the public wished to present evidence whether in support of or in opposition to the Application. None requested to speak.

Mr. Schroeder moved that the Historic Preservation Commission **approve** a Certificate of Appropriateness and find the proposed Major Work at: **5 Everett Road** **congruous** with the Pinehurst Historic District and **consistent** with Historic District Standards, based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Schroeder moved to close the Public Hearing and re-enter the Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Staff and the Commission discussed the date of the next Work Session. The date of the next Work Session was set for 11-04-21 from 09:00 – 11:00 AM in Assembly Hall.

Staff and the Commission discussed the case load of the upcoming Regular Meeting 11-18-21.

Staff and the Commission discussed the contents of Staff Reports and applications, and the authority Staff has to provide feedback to Applicants regarding material submitted. Ms. Rye informed the Commission that Staff has been working on a revised application packet, which would streamline the application process for Applicants, the Commission and Staff.

Staff and the Commission discussed moving from paper copies to digital copies with the adoption of Electronic Permitting requirement, which goes into effect January of 2022.

IV. Next Meeting Date

A. Regular Meeting November 18th, 2021.

V. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Schroeder made a motion to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Herring.

Approved by a vote of 5-0 at 7:26 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is available on the Village website at www.vopnc.org.

Vision: The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community, which reflects our rich history and traditions. Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors. Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.