



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, OCTOBER 27TH, 2022
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

Eric Von Salzen, Chair
John Taylor
David Herring
Terry Lurtz
Richard Vincent

Members Absent:

Tom Schroeder, Vice-Chair
Cara Mathis

Staff Present:

Alfred Cassidy, Senior Planner
Maria Carpenter, Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board
Josh Dockery, IT Technician

Approximately 14 member(s) of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Von Salzen called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:01 PM, explained the purpose of the meeting, each Commission member introduce themselves, and Mr. Von Salzen introduced Staff. Mr. Von Salzen noted the absence of Ms. Mathis and Mr. Schroeder.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 09-22-2022 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Lurtz moved to approve the minutes of the September 22nd, 2022 Regular Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

All Commission members stated they had visited all sites with the exception of Mr. Vincent, who did not visit 60-62 Cherokee Rd., and did not have any ex parte communication with the exception of Mr. Taylor and Mr. Herring, who did have non-substantive ex parte communication with the Owner(s) of 60-62 Cherokee Rd., and Mr. Von Salzen, who did have substantive ex-parte communication via e-mail from a resident regarding 38 Chinquapin Rd. Based on Mr. Von Salzen's ex parte communication regarding 38 Chinquapin Rd., Mr. Von Salzen recused himself from considering and chairing the hearing on this case.

Mr. Von Salzen explained the procedures of a quasi-judicial public hearing.

Ms. Carpenter and Mr. Cassidy were sworn into the Public Hearing and testified as follows.

III. Public Hearing

A. COA-2022-00175 (160 Saville Row)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the construction of a new single-family dwelling at 160 Saville Row. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 20170033. The property owners are Mike and Deborah Piazza and the applicant is Bartlett Construction LLC.

Mr. Kevin Bartlett was sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, and Mr. Bartlett discussed the removal of trees not creating an impediment to the Commission approving the application due to all of the trees proposed for removal being within the footprint of the house and driveway, the location of the proposed vertical lap siding being on the dormer or bump out gables, the location of the driveway as shown in Exhibit A-2.1 being to the left of the proposed house due to placement of the garage being on the high side of the structure to minimize steps and to add curb appeal to the approach to the property, and the proposed wood for the columns (cedar), main entry door (mahogany), and garage doors (walnut) all being woods that will darken overtime to complement each other.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor or against the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Von Salzen closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00175) and find the proposed Major Work at 160 Saville Row is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Lurtz. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor asked for clarification on whether hearsay regarding issues presented at the closing of the sale of the property at 38 Chinquapin Rd. in relation to ownership of some of the exterior site features would be relevant given the proposed exterior demolition coming before the Commission and on whether Staff is aware of any issues of ownership regarding some of the exterior site features. Ms. Carpenter stated no demolition is being presented to the Commission, only minor exterior site changes.

Mr. Von Salzen recused himself from the Public Hearing on COA-2022-00178 (38 Chinquapin Rd.) due to substantive ex parte communication with a resident via e-mail regarding the proposed work. It was decided Mr. Taylor would act as Chair for the hearing of the case.

B. COA-2022-00178 (38 Chinquapin Rd.)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for replacing the front door, painting doors and trim, removing a pergola, landscaping, removal of a light pole and adding a new clock, removing 2 pillars, and removing a decorative fountain at 38 Chinquapin Rd. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00030476. The property owner is Conner Smith and the applicant is Eric Hammer, Hammer Hospitality.

Mr. Eric Hammer and Mr. Conner Smith were sworn into the public hearing.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, Mr. Hammer, and Mr. Smith discussed the proposed work all being eligible for Minor Work approval with the only exception being the proposed changes to the main entry door (which are considered Major Work), the goal of the proposed changes being to bring back historical details and remove liberties taken by the previous Owner that do not comply with the Standards, the removal of the fountain and the original brick behind, the characteristics of the proposed main entry door and the modern details of the door being incongruous with the District especially given the lack of evidence supporting congruity, the location of the main entrance, and, while many commercial buildings have "marque" type entrances, the incongruity of the proposed main entry door with other commercial building main entrances in the District cannot be overlooked.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor or against the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

The Commission debated whether the proposed main entry door functioned more like a special "marque" entrance or sign than a part of the architecture, the incongruity of the proposed main entry door, approval of an incongruous main entry door setting precedent for approval of other similar doors throughout the commercial part of the District, and the location of the main entry door being recessed and accessed through a walkway / patio.

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00178) and find the proposed Major Work at 38 Chinguapin Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Herring.

The Commission debated whether the proposed work is congruous with the District and if additional evidence was needed to make a decision. The Commission clarified approval cannot be given to proposed work that is deemed incongruous with the District.

The Commission, Ms. Carpenter, Mr. Hammer and Mr. Smith discussed what options the Applicants had regarding being granted approval. Mr. Hammer and Mr. Smith decided to remove the proposed main entry door changes from consideration.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00178) and find the proposed Major Work at 38 Chinguapin Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Conditions: The front door has been withdrawn from the application. Other changes have been approved by the Commission (painting side door and trim, removing pergola, removing 2 brick pillars, removing a wall fountain, removing bushes and adding pea gravel, removing a light and replace with clock). Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

C. COA-2022-00159 (190 Linden Rd.)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for the construction of an addition to the front of the property and to renovate the existing home as depicted on the attached site plan located at 190 Linden Road. On September 10, 2020, the Historic Preservation Commission approved the previous request for multiple exterior modifications to the property. Due to the recession and the increase in the cost of building materials, the applicants chose to delay the construction phase until building materials become more affordable. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00028702. The property owners are Brett and Cassandra Dunson and the applicant is Cassandra Dunson.

Ms. Cassandra Dunson was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Cassidy discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the materials submitted by Mr. Cassidy into evidence.

The Commission, Mr. Cassidy, and Ms. Dunson discussed the difference in the proposed changes to what was approved two years ago being an increase in the size of the proposed addition (approximately 500 square feet larger than what was previously proposed), the addition of an entry door to the side of the garage for access to the rear of the property, a decrease in the proposed addition heights from 10-12 feet down to 9-10 feet, a change in the type / style of siding at the entryway, and a change in entry door style to French doors with the exception of the main entry door; and the need to specify a color from the approved color palette to facilitate approval.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor or against the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Von Salzen closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

The Commission debated whether it was possible to grant approval without a condition or specification on the exact color to be used. Ms. Dunson asked for clarification on what an approved color from the color palette would be and agreed to work with Staff to select a color from the approved color palette that is within the range of neutral white and gray.

Mr. Taylor moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00159) and find the proposed Major Work at 190 Linden Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Conditions: The Applicant work with Staff to find a color between neutral white and grey from the approved color palette. Seconded by Mr. Herring. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

D. COA-2022-00183 (60-62 Cherokee Rd.)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District to install a metal roof to certain sections of the principal structure (single-family home) at 60 Cherokee Road and the guest cottage at 62 Cherokee Road. Both properties are identified as Moore County PID Number 00022043. The property owners are Wesley and Anna Smith and the applicant is Sean Butler of Butler Constructs Design.

Mr. Sean Butler and Mr. Wesley Smith were sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Cassidy discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Von Salzen accepted the materials submitted by Mr. Cassidy into evidence.

The Commission, Mr. Cassidy, Mr. Butler, and Mr. Smith discussed the proposed metal roof color of black needing to be reviewed under the existing Standards and not the newly adopted Standards (which go into effect on 10-28-2022), the proposed work being necessary due to roof damage to the accessory structure resulting from a recent hurricane, the existing roofing material having been discontinued and no longer available, the intentions behind the proposed work being an attempt at making the roof more historically compatible while also making the accessory structure more compatible with the main structure, the need for metal roofing on some sections of both the accessory and main structure due to slope and drainage issues, the proposed standing metal seam roofing material matching what had been present on the home originally, the new proposed roof structures over the entry doors being needed to help provide protection from the elements, the location of proposed standing seam metal roofing as depicted in Exhibit S-1.6 being on the front façade, and the wooden supports for the proposed new roof structures being painted white to match existing.

Mr. Von Salzen asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor or against the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Von Salzen closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

The Commission debated whether the submitted evidence was adequate enough to support a decision by the Commission and a post work inspection by Staff to determine compliance, if it would be possible to approve only the proposed work for the accessory structure and continue a decision on the proposed work for the main structure to a later meeting (it was determined splitting the approval is not allowed and the application must be voted on as a whole).

Mr. Lurtz moved that the Historic Preservation Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2022-00183) and find the proposed Major Work at 60-62 Cherokee Rd. is consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed congruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Denied by a vote of 2-3 with Mr. Von Salzen, Mr. Taylor, and Mr. Herring voting "Nay".

The Commission debated voting to continue the case to a later meeting to provide the Applicant time to provide additional materials and determined a motion to continue was needed.

Mr. Taylor moved to continue the Public Hearing to a Special Meeting on Wednesday, November 09, 2022 at 05:00 PM in Assembly Hall. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

Mr. Taylor moved to adjourn the Public Hearing and re-enter the Regular Meeting. No second was made. Approved by a vote of 5-0.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items

A. Minor Work COA's Issued 09/13/22-10/13/22

V. Next Meeting Date

11-17-2022 Regular Meeting

VI. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Lurtz moved to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Taylor. Approved by a vote of 5-0 at 06:11 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Clerk to the Board &
Planning Administrative Specialist
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is located on the Village website: www.vopnc.org.

The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community which reflects our rich history and traditions.

Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors.

Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.