



**HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING
THURSDAY, OCTOBER 26TH, 2023
ASSEMBLY HALL
395 MAGNOLIA ROAD
PINEHURST, NORTH CAROLINA
4:00 PM**

Members Present:

John Taylor, Chair
Richard Vincent, Vice Chair
Roxanne Vaitkus
David Herring
Angelique Fabiani
Cara Mathis
Karl Ecker

Members Absent:

Staff Present:

Pamela Graham, Planning Supervisor
Michael Mandeville, Senior Planner
Maria Carpenter, Planner
Shannon Konstantinou, Clerk to the Board
Shelby Grow, Administrative Specialist
Lori Hercules, IT Technician

Approximately 4 member(s) of the public in attendance.

I. Call to Order

Mr. Taylor called the Regular Meeting to order at 04:03 PM. Mr. Taylor explained the purpose of the meeting, each Commission member introduced themselves, and Mr. Taylor introduced Staff.

Mr. Cameron announced Ms. Shelby Grow's promotion from Customer Service Representative to the role of Administrative Specialist.

II. Approval of Minutes

A. 09-28-2023 Work Session Meeting Minutes

Mr. Ecker moved to approve the minutes of the September 28th, 2023 Meeting. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

B. 09-28-2023 Regular Meeting Minutes

Mr. Ecker moved to approve the minutes of the September 28th, 2023 Meeting. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

Mr. Ecker moved to recess the Regular Meeting and open the Public Hearing. Seconded by Ms. Vaitkus. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

III. Public Hearing

All Commission members stated they had visited all sites and did not have any ex parte communication.

Mr. Taylor explained the procedures of a quasi-judicial public hearing.

Ms. Carpenter was sworn into the Public Hearing and testified as follows.

A. COA-2023-00274 (125 Graham Rd) (continued)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for a new single-family dwelling at 125 Graham Rd. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00020108. The property owners are David and Louise Parks and the applicant is Thomas Bradford.

Ms. Carpenter stated the Applicant asked the Commission to continue the meeting to the November 16th, 2023 Regular Meeting.

Mr. Ecker moved to continue the case to the next Public Hearing of November 16th, 2023. Seconded by Ms. Fabiani. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

B. COA-2023-00388 (38 Chinquapin Rd)

The purpose of this public hearing is to consider a request for a Major Certificate of Appropriateness within the Pinehurst Historic District for painting the brick façade white at 38 Chinquapin Rd. The property is identified as Moore County PID Number 00030476. The property owner is Conner Smith and the applicant is Daniel Brown.

Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed work and submitted into evidence the Staff Report with attachments / exhibits, Presentation, and Application and Applicant's materials / exhibits. Mr. Taylor accepted the materials submitted by Ms. Carpenter into evidence.

The Commission thanked Ms. Carpenter for her presentation.

Mr. Daniel Brown, Contractor, was sworn into the public hearing.

Mr. Brown stated the intention behind painting the brick is to hide many areas of patch work, window replacement damage, and mismatched joints.

The Commission, Mr. Brown, and Ms. Carpenter discussed the proposed paint will be used for the brick only and the existing white trim will remain the same with the shutters being painted black and overhangs or additional trim being painted "White Tail", the proposed paint having a slight yellow tint to it and being a match to a Benjamin Moore color from the approved color palette, the cupola being white to match the existing trim.

Mr. Taylor reminded the Commission the application is to consider painting of the brick only, and painting of any other trim, etc. is not in the purview of the Commission for this hearing.

The Commission, Mr. Brown, and Ms. Carpenter discussed the Standards for residential and commercial properties with regard to painted brick being the same (residential painted brick referenced on page 32 and commercial painted brick referenced in the section dealing with masonry); the brick being historic but also containing many patches of different brick and mortar areas; reviewed Exhibit X-1 showing the existing, unpainted brick façade of the property; whether the brick could be cleaned instead of painted to enhance the appearance of the façade; discussed previously approved replacement of the entry door and the condition of other existing entry doors; the variations in brick and mortar colors adding to the historic charm of the façade; and possibly finding a mineral wash or other type of finish that would achieve the same look at white paint without damaging the brick or causing the brick to fail.

Mr. Taylor asked whether there was any member of the audience wishing to present testimony either in favor of or opposition to the proposed Major Work. None came forward.

Mr. Taylor closed the evidentiary portion of the Public Hearing.

The Commission deliberated whether the different styles / colors / types of brick add to the character of the building, the damage that can occur to brick when painted, painted brick on commercial buildings that were not previously painted is or is not compatible with the District, using a mineral wash technique instead of standard paint or solid opaque paint, allowing the property to be painted white setting a precedent for other properties to be painted white, the whole building (all elevations) being painted, other options to soften the repair / patched areas that do not involve painting the brick, the proposal having two sides to consider: preserving the brick integrity and not setting precedent aesthetically, continuing the case to allow the Applicant to modify the proposal, the different ages of different sections of the building, consideration of contributing or not contributing not being in the purview of the Commission, and any change from the proposed painting of the brick requiring a new application.

Mr. Herring moved that the Historic Preservation Commission deny a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA-2023-00388) and find the proposed Major Work at 38 Chinguapin Rd. is not consistent with Historic District Standards and is deemed incongruous with the Pinehurst Historic District based on the testimony given, the material submitted and the findings of fact. Seconded by Mr. Ecker. Approved by a vote of 6-1 with Ms. Vaitkus dissenting.

Mr. Ecker moved to adjourn the Public Hearing and re-enter the Regular Meeting. Seconded by Ms. Mathis. Approved by a vote of 7-0.

IV. Review of Normal Maintenance and Minor Work Items
A. Minor Work COA's Issued 09/15/2023 – 10/14/2023.

V. Next Meeting Date
11-16-2023 Regular Meeting

The Commission and Staff discussed scheduling additional Work Session to continue the review of proposed revisions to the Standards. It was agreed a Work Session would be held in January with the date being determined at either the November or December Regular Meeting.

Mr. Ecker announced his departure from the Commission in December due to a relocation outside of Pinehurst.

Additionally, Mr. Taylor announced his term and eligibility to serve on the Commission expires in January 2024.

VI. Motion to Adjourn

Mr. Ecker moved to adjourn the meeting. Seconded by Mr. Vincent. Approved by a vote of 7-0 at 04:55 PM.

Respectfully Submitted,



Shannon Konstantinou
Village Clerk
Village of Pinehurst

A videotape of this meeting is located on the Village website: www.vopnc.org.

The Village of Pinehurst is a charming, vibrant community which reflects our rich history and traditions.

Mission: Promote, enhance, and sustain the quality of life for residents, businesses, and visitors.

Values: Service, Initiative, Teamwork, and Improvement.